| **Student Name:** Ethan Woo |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Excellent opening, but do we fix this problem? Make the focus on moral illegitimacy without making it about the practical outcome specifically. You can also make the opening about how the quality of sports is worsening as a result.  Set-up   * Rather than imposing it on average to high paying, the cap only kicks in at the highest level. POI - he’s punishing you for the easy out you are trying to take. The above helps you avoid this. * Where is this money spent instead? Do you mandate these clubs to spend it on club resources?   Argument 1   * Thesis? * Explain why they spend it on lavish salaries! Why or how has this ended up happening? How has it impacted sports? We spend too much time repeating how we waste this money rather than explaining how we reached this point and why it is bad for the sport. * Good comparison to other individuals - but can we help them in any way? * We need to start by pointing out WHY it is a waste - is it because this creates bad standards in the sports world, is it because we value these sportspeople too much? * Explain what this does to the sport/the athlete in terms of quality, in terms of their willingness to go to the highest bidder - which is worse for sport for reasons you can explain.   This is a debate about how clubs create barriers to entry because only the wealthy ones can compete due to getting the best talent; consider how this harms sports, or sport development as well.  Microstructure within the argument is missing; the chain of analysis also shifts from moral to discussing outcome; let’s focus on the specific outcome and proving it.  04:52 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Tongtong Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Clear opening on hard work; but why do they need this much money? That’s the contestation Prop has in this debate.  Set-up   * Framing: hard work and merit - fair enough; but give me examples and illustrate this rather than repeating your opinion. Fair on revenue generation. * We only need 1 problem characterisation, rather than multiple ones; just present the framed problem as the framing in the round. * Explain what the incentives of clubs are - and why your interpretation is correct; why do they behave in this way?   Rebuttal   * In order to respond to what they say, you need to explain why the sheer amount being earned is justified, rather than just any random amount; you need to explain why millions is sufficient. * Our responses needed to do the above! We barely engaged with the content from 1P.   Argument 1   * Thesis? * Why do clubs behave in the manner you claim? You assert this, rather than explaining why this is true. * Do they always work hard and go out of their comfort zones? * What sources of motivation exist in athletes’ lives? Why is money so important? Think of the risk of playing a sport professionally; why do they deserve to be compensated in the way that they do?   We need to take a POI!  04:34 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Hanna Zhang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Excellent opening. Point out how Opp had to justify WHY hard work merits a LAVISH salary rather than just a decent salary. Why do they need the AMOUNT of money they do. Excellent link to commercialisation.  Give me the title of third substantive in signposting!  Rebuttal   * Principle legitimacy - commercialisation and exposure - I don’t understand this response. * On corruption - is this corruption per say? Or rather that it’s just unnecessary? * We made a perfect recovery on principle. * Explain why clubs spend it on lavish salaries! Why or how has this ended up happening? How has it impacted sports? We spend too much time repeating how we waste this money rather than explaining how we reached this point and why it is bad for the sport. * We need to start by pointing out WHY it is a waste - is it because this creates bad standards in the sports world, is it because we value these sportspeople too much?   Argument 1   * Explain what this does to the sport/the athlete in terms of quality, in terms of their willingness to go to the highest bidder - which is worse for sport for reasons you can explain. * Excellent on where athletes end up going! * Explain how we want to **correct** these distorted norms.   This is also a debate about how clubs create barriers to entry because only the wealthy ones can compete due to getting the best talent; consider how this harms sports, or sport development as well.  **Hanna, we’re so smart and so capable, but we need to believe in ourselves. I believe in your ability to do so so well - you need to believe in yourself too! Your speech today was great - but we’re limiting ourselves because we believe nothing other than the PERFECT speech is okay for us to give.**  03:57 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Emilia Lau |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why are we numbering the rebuttals we have…? Start with a clear call out of the biggest!  Rebuttal - we need to conduct rebuttals on an issue by issue basis, rather than speaker by speaker so as to prevent repetition.   * Misuse of team resources - you’re pointing this out now, but then saying you will actually rebut it later; this leads to a confusing sentence/structure within your speech; the same applies to the second summary you have. If your rebuttal is integrated, say as such - and that you’ll flag it when the argument occurs. * Why is money the biggest motivator? Why are there no other competing preferences that athletes have? * Why will the clubs use it on equipment and resources? Is this something we explain?   Argument 1   * Why does this hard work necessitate such high pay? In order to respond to what they say, you need to explain why the sheer amount being earned is justified, rather than just any random amount; you need to explain why millions is sufficient. * Is this a new argument?   What sources of motivation exist in athletes’ lives? Why is money so important? Think of the risk of playing a sport professionally; why do they deserve to be compensated in the way that they do?  04:09 - big time improvement + focus improvement - we now need to focus on structure + analytical rigour! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Theo Lee |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The direction in your opening needs to be clear; we shouldn’t just jump into our speech. We also don’t really structure our speech much - let’s pay closer attention to this next time!  Why is our side able to guarantee money goes to support staff or facilities?  Stop and explain the structure of your speech; for instance; in this speech I’m going to go through responses speaker by speaker; let’s start with the first speaker. Point out how Opp had to justify WHY hard work merits a LAVISH salary rather than just a decent salary. Why do they need the AMOUNT of money they do? Excellent use of examples here! We need to link this back to the motion.  POI response - point out you’re happy for people to earn money; just not this much money. We need to start by pointing out WHY it is a waste - is it because this creates bad standards in the sports world, is it because we value these sportspeople too much?  Explain why clubs spend it on lavish salaries! Why or how has this ended up happening? How has it impacted sports? We spend too much time repeating how we waste this money rather than explaining how we reached this point and why it is bad for the sport.  Explain what this does to the sport/the athlete in terms of quality, in terms of their willingness to go to the highest bidder - which is worse for sport for reasons you can explain.  Explain how we want to **correct** these distorted norms.  This is also a debate about how clubs create barriers to entry because only the wealthy ones can compete due to getting the best talent; consider how this harms sports, or sport development as well.  Good response to the second POI!  Stop citing that you watch basketball; you don’t need to caveat every example with this!  04:56 - Excellent work extending your speaking time! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Adrian Wong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The structure of this speech is all over the place. We need clear cut clashes when we speak third!  Good work pointing this out! Explain what the implication of this is in their case; excellent analysis on why the risk of being a sportsperson is SO high. We do end up getting into repetition territory pretty quickly - so make sure you stay on track with the implication; explain how this means you disincentivize the likelihood of risk. Excellent analysis on the culture Prop creates. You spend too much time doing this though.  POI - good response; good on how athletes do more than just play sports; explain how their KPIs are radically different than any other professional in the field. Good on average person and whether they get any benefit or not.  Good on marginal increase/decrease and chances of success.  What sources of motivation exist in athletes’ lives? Why is money so important? Why does this outweigh it?  Excellent style today.  We only explain why the other side is wrong; you need to do comparative analysis instead!  I am strongly considering moving you up to PSD III - stay back for a moment and talk to me about it so that we can discuss!  05:04 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ellie Fu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house would place a cap on the salary of professional sports people |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Give me a stronger opening! We also have no structure in this speech! Give me clashes, or give me reasons as to why you win - clear cut ones!  Why would it even go to executives instead? Emilia says that it can be invested into resources. Which one is correct? Explain what the incentives of clubs are - and why your interpretation is correct; why do they behave in this way?  In order to respond to what they say, you need to explain why the sheer amount being earned is justified, rather than just any random amount; you need to explain why millions is sufficient. Use the analysis Adrian has in his speech!  What sources of motivation exist in athletes’ lives? Why is money so important? Think of the risk of playing a sport professionally; why do they deserve to be compensated in the way that they do?  We need to offer more POIs - well done offering one today!  **I will not tolerate random lines/memes being dropped in your speech. Never do this again.**  03:08 | | | | | | |